

## **PE1105/CCC**

14 September 2012

Ms Alison Wilson  
Assistant Clerk  
Public Petitions Committee  
The Scottish Parliament  
Edinburgh  
EH99 1SP

Dear Ms Wilson

### **Consideration of Petition PE1105**

Thank you for the opportunity to respond to the comments contained in the letters from Mr Mark O'Donnell, Acting Deputy Director, Scottish Government (3rd August 2012) and Mr Robert Calderwood, Chief Executive, NHS Greater Glasgow and Clyde (NHS GGC - 7th August 2012) in response to your letter of 26<sup>th</sup> June 2012.

The Committee asked the Scottish Government and NHSGGC to:

- Provide clarity on why there is a disparity between the payment per bed for St Margaret of Scotland Hospice and the payments per bed for other hospices both under the jurisdiction of the Greater Glasgow and Clyde Health Board and throughout Scotland?
- Confirm if this disparity will be resolved by the recent guidance on the future funding for hospices which was published as a Chief Executive Letter (CEL 12 (2012)) in May 2012?

Mr Calderwood stated "Hospices provide a huge range of services and inpatient beds are only a small part of their activity". Whilst this is true as most Hospices provide a day service, community service, education, outpatients, bereavement support, etc., the Palliative Care review carried out by Audit Scotland identified that in the main, all Hospices provide the same services.

Payment per bed is the basis on which hospitals costs are calculated. In addition, the reporting framework requested by NHSGGC only asks for information relating to inpatient information and community patients. There is no mechanism for reporting the activity within Day Hospice, Bereavement Support, Outpatients, etc. (a copy of the sample monitoring report is attached). Therefore, it is difficult to understand how NHSGGC can benchmark the services between Hospices when they do not understand or appreciate the services provided.

I understand and am aware that the guidance provided by the Scottish Government in its' policies, frameworks and resources to NHS Boards are to allow them "decide how best to deliver high quality, safe and sustainable services to meet the needs of its local population." In the response from Mr O'Donnell, he took the stance that "it would not therefore be appropriate for Scottish Government to intervene directly in or comment on matters relating to the payment per bed costs of any individual hospice within a NHS Board area." However, I ask the Petitions Committee to consider whether it is fair that one Hospice in Glasgow should receive considerably less funding than all other Hospices in Glasgow, and indeed Scotland – and should the Scottish Government not take steps within their policies, frameworks and resources to NHS Boards to ensure that a fair approach is in place across Scotland to prevent such disparity in funding? NHS Boards are surely accountable to the Scottish Government in terms of how these policies and frameworks are put in place?

The recently published guideline CEL 12 (2012), as Mr O'Donnell referred, "will support NHS Boards and independent hospices in determining and agreeing local commissioning arrangements." In my letter to the Petitions Committee in January 2012, I commented the consistent approach this guideline sets out to achieve will be welcome as at present, discussions with Health Boards do not achieve this level of consistency in relation to individual Hospice funding.

St Margaret of Scotland Hospice's current baseline funding from NHSGGC is considerably less than that provided to other Hospices. For example, a Hospice within NHSGGC with 10 Specialist Palliative Care beds receives more funding per annum than St Margaret's, which has 30 Specialist Palliative Care beds (operationally, 26 Specialist Palliative Care beds). It remains unclear how CEL 12 (2012) will address the substantial disparity in the funding to St Margaret of Scotland Hospice.

I greatly appreciate that the petition has been kept open and ask that this remains the same until the Hospice funding arrangements have been entirely resolved.

Yours sincerely

Jean Anne Mitchell  
Petitioner